INFORMATION PRIVACY LAW

Sixth Edition

Daniel J. Solove
John Marshall Harlan Research Professor of Law
George Washington University Law School

Paul M. Schwartz
Jefferson E. Peyser Professor of Law
U.C. Berkeley School of Law
Faculty Director, Berkeley Center for Law & Technology
# SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

## Contents

*Preface* xxvii  
*Acknowledgments* xxix  

## 1 INTRODUCTION

A. Information Privacy, Technology, and the Law 1

B. Information Privacy Law: Origins and Types 10

## 2 PERSPECTIVES ON PRIVACY

A. The Philosophical Discourse about Privacy 41

B. The Definition and the Value of Privacy 43

C. Critics of Privacy 63

D. The Feminist Perspective on Privacy 70

## 3 PRIVACY AND THE MEDIA

A. Information Gathering 81

B. Disclosure of Truthful Information 106

C. Dissemination of False Information 174

D. Appropriation of Name or Likeness 211

E. Privacy Protections for Anonymity and Receipt of Ideas 233

## 4 PRIVACY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT

A. The Fourth Amendment and Emerging Technology 256

B. Information Gathering About First Amendment Activities 331

C. Federal Electronic Surveillance Law 344

D. Digital Searches and Seizures 359

## 5 NATIONAL SECURITY AND FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE

A. The Intelligence Community 408

B. The Fourth Amendment Framework 409

C. Foreign Intelligence Gathering 417

D. NSA Surveillance 444
6 HEALTH PRIVACY 475
A. Confidentiality of Medical Information 477
B. Constitutional Protection of Medical Information 542
C. Genetic Information 582

7 GOVERNMENT RECORDS 603
A. Public Access to Government Records 604
B. Government Records and Use of Personal Data 663
C. Identification Records and Requirements 720

8 FINANCIAL DATA 737
A. The Fair Credit Reporting Act 737
B. The Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act 773
C. Federal and State Financial Privacy Laws 776

9 CONSUMER DATA 785
A. The U.S. System of Consumer Data Privacy Regulation 786
B. Tort Law 820
C. Contract Law 829
D. Property Law 842
E. FTC Section 5 Enforcement 845
F. Statutory Regulation 876
G. First Amendment Limitations on Privacy Regulation 918

10 DATA SECURITY 945
A. Introduction 945
B. Data Security Breach Notification Statutes 947
C. Civil Liability and Standing 952
D. FTC Regulation 975

11 EDUCATION PRIVACY 991
A. School Searches and Surveillance 991
B. Drug Testing 997
C. School Records 1007

12 EMPLOYMENT PRIVACY 1017
A. Workplace Searches 1020
B. Workplace Surveillance 1028
C. Workplace Drug Testing 1031
D. The Issue of Consent 1042
E. Testing, Questionnaires, and Polygraphs 1049
F. Telephone Monitoring 1062
G. Computer Monitoring and Searches 1069
13 INTERNATIONAL PRIVACY LAW 1093
   A. The OECD Privacy Guidelines 1096
   B. Privacy Protection in Europe 1100
   C. International Transfers of Data 1173
   D. The APEC Privacy Framework 1203
   E. Privacy Protection in North America 1205
   F. Privacy Protection in South America 1208
   G. Privacy Protection in Africa and the Middle East 1209
   H. Privacy Protection in Asia-Pacific 1210

Index 1215
B. THE DEFINITION AND THE VALUE OF PRIVACY 43

- Alan Westin, *Privacy and Freedom* 44
- Julie E. Cohen, *Examined Lives: Informational Privacy and the Subject as Object* 49
- Daniel J. Solove, *Conceptualizing Privacy* 52
- Anita L. Allen, *Coercing Privacy* 55
- Paul M. Schwartz, *Privacy and Democracy in Cyberspace* 58
- Spiros Simitis, *Reviewing Privacy in an Information Society* 60

C. CRITICS OF PRIVACY 63

- Fred H. Cate, *Principles of Internet Privacy* 67

D. THE FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON PRIVACY 70

- State v. Rhodes 70
- Reva B. Siegel, “The Rule of Love”: Wife Beating as Prerogative and Privacy 72
- Catharine A. MacKinnon, *Toward a Feminist Theory of the State* 75

3 PRIVACY AND THE MEDIA 79

A. INFORMATION GATHERING 81

1. Intrusion upon Seclusion 81

- Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652B: Intrusion upon Seclusion 81
- Nader v. General Motors Corp. 82
- Dietemann v. Time, Inc. 87
- Desnick v. American Broadcasting Co., Inc. 89
- Shulman v. Group W Productions, Inc. 94

2. Paparazzi 98

- Galella v. Onassis 99
- California Anti-Paparazzi Act 100

3. Video Voyeurism 103

- Video Voyeurism Prevention Act 104

B. DISCLOSURE OF TRUTHFUL INFORMATION 106

1. Public Disclosure of Private Facts 106

(a) Introduction 106

- Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652D: Publicity Given to Private Life 106

(b) Private Matters 108

- Gill v. Hearst Publishing Co. 108
- Daily Times Democrat v. Graham 113
## CONTENTS

(c) The Newsworthiness Test 120  
- Sipple v. Chronicle Publishing Co. 120  
- Shulman v. Group W Productions, Inc. 130  
- Bonome v. Kaysen 133  

2. First Amendment Limitations 140  
- Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn 142  
- The Florida Star v. B.J.F. 149  
- Bartnicki v. Vopper 164  

### C. DISSEMINATION OF FALSE INFORMATION 174

1. Defamation 174  
   (a) Introduction 174  
   (b) Defamation and the Internet 176  
      - Zeran v. America Online, Inc. 177  
   (c) First Amendment Limitations 185  
      - New York Times Co. v. Sullivan 185  
      - Gertz v. Robert Welch, Inc. 189  

2. False Light 196  
   (a) Introduction 196  
      - Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652E: Publicity Placing Person in False Light 196  
   (b) First Amendment Limitations 198  
      - Time, Inc. v. Hill 198  

3. Infliction of Emotional Distress 202  
   - Hustler Magazine v. Falwell 203  
   - Snyder v. Phelps 205  

### D. APPROPRIATION OF NAME OR LIKENESS 211

1. Introduction 211  
   - Restatement (Second) of Torts § 652C: Appropriation of Name or Likeness 211  

2. Name or Likeness 214  
   - Carson v. Here’s Johnny Portable Toilets, Inc. 214  

3. For One’s Own Use or Benefit 221  
   - Raymen v. United Senior Association, Inc. 221  

4. Connection to Matters of Public Interest 225  
   - Finger v. Omni Publications International, Ltd. 226  

5. First Amendment Limitations 230  
   - Zacchini v. Scripps-Howard Broadcasting Co. 230
E. PRIVACY PROTECTIONS FOR ANONYMITY AND RECEIPT OF IDEAS 233

1. Anonymity 233
   (a) Anonymous Speech 233
      ● Talley v. State of California 233
      ● McIntyre v. Ohio Elections Commission 234
      ● Doe v. Cahill 239
   (b) Reporter’s Privilege 245

2. Privacy of Reading and Intellectual Exploration 247
   ● Stanley v. Georgia 248

4 PRIVACY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT 253

A. THE FOURTH AMENDMENT AND EMERGING TECHNOLOGY 256

1. How the Fourth Amendment Works 256
   (a) Applicability: Searches and Seizures 256
   (b) Reasonable Searches and Seizures 257
   (c) Enforcement: The Exclusionary Rule and Civil Remedies 259
   (d) Subpoenas and Court Orders 260

2. Wiretapping, Bugging, and Beyond 263
   ● Olmstead v. United States 264
   ● Lopez v. United States 271
   ● Katz v. United States 273
   ● United States v. White 280

3. The Reasonable Expectation of Privacy Test 284
   (a) The Third Party Doctrine 284
      ● Smith v. Maryland 284
   (b) Items Abandoned or Exposed to the Public 295
      ● California v. Greenwood 295
   (c) Surveillance and the Use of Sense Enhancement Technologies 301
      ● Florida v. Riley 302
      ● Dow Chemical Co. v. United States 309
      ● Kyllo v. United States 313
      ● United States v. Jones 321

B. INFORMATION GATHERING ABOUT FIRST AMENDMENT ACTIVITIES 331
   ● Stanford v. Texas 333
   ● Gonzales v. Google 340
### C. FEDERAL ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE LAW

1. Section 605 of the Federal Communications Act
2. Title III
3. The Electronic Communications Privacy Act
   (a) The Wiretap Act
   (b) The Stored Communications Act
   (c) The Pen Register Act
4. The Communications Assistance for Law Enforcement Act
5. The USA PATRIOT Act
6. State Electronic Surveillance Law

### D. DIGITAL SEARCHES AND SEIZURES

1. Searching Computers and Electronic Devices
   - United States v. Andrus
   - Riley v. California
2. Encryption
3. Video Surveillance
4. E-mail and Online Communications
   - Steve Jackson Games, Inc. v. United States Secret Service
   - United States v. Warshak
5. ISP Account Information
   - United States v. Hambrick
6. IP Addresses, URLs, and Internet Searches
   - United States v. Forrester

### 5 NATIONAL SECURITY AND FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE

#### A. THE INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY

#### B. THE FOURTH AMENDMENT FRAMEWORK

- United States v. United States District Court (The Keith Case)

#### C. FOREIGN INTELLIGENCE GATHERING

1. The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act
   - Global Relief Foundation, Inc. v. O’Neil
   - United States v. Isa
2. The USA PATRIOT Act
   - The 9/11 Commission Report
   - In re Sealed Case
4. Internal Oversight
   (a) The Attorney General’s FBI Guidelines 440
   (b) The Homeland Security Act 442
   (c) The Intelligence Reform and Terrorism Prevention Act 443

D. NSA SURVEILLANCE 444
   1. Standing 446
      ● Clapper v. Amnesty International USA 446
   2. The Snowden Revelations 455
      ● Klayman v. Obama 457
      ● In re FBI 466

6 HEALTH PRIVACY 475

A. CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL INFORMATION 477
   1. Professional Ethics and Evidentiary Privileges 477
      (a) Ethical Rules 477
         ● Oath and Law of Hippocrates 477
         ● Current Opinions of the Judicial Council of the American
           Medical Association Canon 5.05 477
      (b) Evidentiary Privileges 477
         ● Jaffee v. Redmond 479
   2. Tort Liability for Disclosure of Patient Information 483
      ● McCormick v. England 483
      ● Hammonds v. Aetna Casualty & Surety Co. 485
   3. Tort Liability for Failure to Disclose Patient Information 492
      ● Tarasoff v. Regents of University of California 492
      ● McIntosh v. Milano 499
   4. Statutory Reporting Requirements 504
   5. State Law Privacy Protections for Medical Information 506
   6. Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act 509
      (a) A Brief History of HIPAA 509
      (b) Scope and Applicability of HIPAA 511
      (c) The Privacy Rule 514
         ● Northwestern Memorial Hospital v. Ashcroft 520
      (d) The Security Rule 524
      (e) The Breach Notification Rule 525
      (f) HIPAA Enforcement and Preemption 525
         ● Parkview Health System, Inc. Resolution Agreement
           and Corrective Action Plan 526
         ● University of California at Los Angeles Health System
           Resolution Agreement and Corrective Action Plan 529
B. CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTION OF MEDICAL INFORMATION 542
1. The Constitutional Right to Privacy 542
   ● Griswold v. Connecticut 543
   ● Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey 549
   ● Lawrence v. Texas 555
2. The Constitutional Right to Information Privacy 560
   ● Whalen v. Roe 560
   ● 42 U.S.C. § 1983 and “Constitutional Torts” 567
   ● Carter v. Broadlawns Medical Center 568
   ● Doe v. Borough of Barrington 569
   ● Doe v. Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority 572
3. The Fourth Amendment 579
   ● Ferguson v. City of Charleston 579

C. GENETIC INFORMATION 582
1. Genetic Privacy 582
2. Property Rights in Body Parts and DNA 584
   ● Moore v. Regents of the University of California 584
3. Genetic Testing and Discrimination 596
   ● Richard A. Epstein, The Legal Regulation of Genetic Discrimination: Old Responses to New Technology 597
   ● Paul M. Schwartz, Privacy and the Economics of Health Care Information 598

7 GOVERNMENT RECORDS 603
A. PUBLIC ACCESS TO GOVERNMENT RECORDS 604
1. Public Records and Court Records 604
   ● Doe v. Shakur 605
2. The Freedom of Information Act 610
   ● United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press 613
   ● National Archives and Records Administration v. Favish 619
3. Constitutional Requirements of Public Access 628
   ● Los Angeles Police Department v. United Reporting Publishing Corp. 630
4. Constitutional Limitations on Public Access 636
   (a) Public Records 636
      ● Kallstrom v. City of Columbus 636
   (b) Police Records 644
      ● Cline v. Rogers 645
      ● Scheetz v. The Morning Call, Inc. 646
   (c) Megan’s Laws 650
      ● Paul P. v. Verniero 651
5. The Driver’s Privacy Protection Act 661

B. GOVERNMENT RECORDS AND USE OF PERSONAL DATA 663
   1. Fair Information Practices 663
      ● Marc Rotenberg, Fair Information Practices and the Architecture of Privacy (What Larry Doesn’t Get) 664
   2. The Privacy Act 665
      ● Pippinger v. Rubin 668
      ● Doe v. Chao 673
   3. The Computer Matching and Privacy Protection Act 685
   4. The Use of Government Records 686
      (a) Airline Passenger Screening 686
         ● The 9/11 Commission Report 686
      (b) Government Data Mining 689
         ● U.S. GAO, Data Mining: Federal Efforts Cover a Wide Range of Uses 690
         ● Mary DeRosa, Data Mining and Data Analysis for Counterterrorism 691
         ● United States v. Sokolow 695
         ● Arizona v. Evans 703
         ● United States v. Ellison 707
      (c) DNA Databases 711
         ● United States v. Kincade 711
         ● Maryland v. King 715
   C. Identification Records and Requirements 720
      1. Identification and the Constitution 721
         ● Hiibel v. Sixth Judicial District Court 722
      2. Social Security Numbers 726
         ● Greidinger v. Davis 728
      3. National Identification Systems 731
8 FINANCIAL DATA

A. THE FAIR CREDIT REPORTING ACT

1. FCRA’s Scope and Structure
   - United States v. Spokeo, Inc.
2. Permissible Uses of Consumer Reports
   - Smith v. Bob Smith Chevrolet, Inc.
3. Consumer Rights and Agency Responsibilities
4. Civil Liability and Qualified Immunity
   - Sarver v. Experian Information Solutions
5. Identity Theft and Consumer Reporting
   - Sloane v. Equifax Information Services, LLC

B. THE GRAMM-LEACH-BLILEY ACT

C. FEDERAL AND STATE FINANCIAL PRIVACY LAWS

1. State Financial Laws
2. Laws Regulating Government Access to Financial Data
3. Identity Theft Statutes
4. Tort Law
   - Wolfe v. MBNA America Bank

9 CONSUMER DATA

A. THE U.S. SYSTEM OF CONSUMER DATA PRIVACY REGULATION

1. Structure
2. Types of Law
3. Personally Identifiable Information (PII)
   - Pineda v. Williams-Sonoma Stores
   - Apple v. Krescent
4. Injury and Standing
   - Spokeo, Inc. v. Robins
   - In re Google, Inc. Privacy Policy Litigation

B. TORT LAW

- Dwyer v. American Express Co.
- Remsberg v. Docusearch, Inc.

C. CONTRACT LAW

1. Privacy Policies
   - Jeff Sovern, *Opting In, Opting Out, or No Options at All*
Michael E. Staten & Fred H. Cate, *The Impact of Opt-In Privacy Rules on Retail Markets* 830

2. Contract and Promissory Estoppel 833
   - In re Northwest Airlines Privacy Litigation 833

D. PROPERTY LAW 842

E. FTC SECTION 5 ENFORCEMENT 845
   - In the Matter of Snapchat, Inc. 847
   - FTC v. Toysmart.com 855
   - In the Matter of Facebook, Inc. 861
   - In the Matter of Sears Holdings Management Corp. 867
   - In the Matter of Nomi Technologies, Inc. 873

F. STATUTORY REGULATION 876
   1. Entertainment Records 876
      (a) The Video Privacy Protection Act 876
         - Daniel v. Cantell 879
         - In re Hulu Privacy Litigation 881
         - In re Hulu Privacy Litigation 883
      (b) The Cable Communications Policy Act 886
   2. Internet Use and Electronic Communications 888
      (a) The Children’s Online Privacy Protection Act 888
         - United States v. Path, Inc. 890
      (b) The Electronic Communications Privacy Act 894
         - In re Google, Inc. Gmail Litigation 894
         - Dyer v. Northwest Airlines Corp. 902
      (c) The Computer Fraud and Abuse Act 904
         - Creative Computing v. Getloaded.com LLC 905
         - United States v. Drew 908
   3. Marketing 912
      (a) The Telephone Consumer Protections Act 912
      (b) The CAN-SPAM Act 915

G. FIRST AMENDMENT LIMITATIONS ON PRIVACY REGULATION 918
   - Rowan v. United States Post Office Department 919
   - Mainstream Marketing Services, Inc. v. Federal Trade Commission 920
   - U.S. West, Inc. v. Federal Communications Commission 923
   - Trans Union Corp. v. Federal Trade Commission 931
   - Sorrell v. IMS Health, Inc. 934
10 DATA SECURITY

A. INTRODUCTION 945

B. DATA SECURITY BREACH NOTIFICATION STATUTES 947

C. CIVIL LIABILITY AND STANDING 952
   • Reilly v. Ceridian Corporation 952
   • Resnick v. AvMed 954
   • Remijas v. Neiman Marcus Corp. 962
   • Beck v. McDonald 965

D. FTC REGULATION 975
   • FTC v. Wyndham Worldwide Corporation 977
   • In the Matter of Trendnet 983

11 EDUCATION PRIVACY 991

A. SCHOOL SEARCHES AND SURVEILLANCE 991
   • New Jersey v. T.L.O. 991

B. DRUG TESTING 997
   • Vernonia School District v. Acton 997
   • Board of Educational v. Earls 1002

C. SCHOOL RECORDS 1007
   • The Family Education Rights and Privacy Act 1007
   • Owasso Independent School District v. Falvo 1009

12 EMPLOYMENT PRIVACY 1017

A. WORKPLACE SEARCHES 1020
   • O’Connor v. Ortega 1020
   • K-Mart Corp. v. Trotti 1027

B. WORKPLACE SURVEILLANCE 1028
   • Thompson v. Johnson County Community College 1028

C. WORKPLACE DRUG TESTING 1031
   • National Treasury Employees Union v. Von Raab 1031
   • Chandler v. Miller 1037
   • Borse v. Piece Goods Shop 1038

D. THE ISSUE OF CONSENT 1042
   • Baggs v. Eagle-Picher Industries, Inc. 1042
### E. TESTING, QUESTIONNAIRES, AND POLYGRAPHS 1049

1. Testing and Questionnaires 1049
   - Greenawalt v. Indiana Department of Corrections 1049
   - National Aeronautics and Space Administration v. Nelson 1052

2. Polygraph Testing 1058
   - The Employee Polygraph Protection Act 1061

### F. TELEPHONE MONITORING 1062

   - Watkins v. L.M. Berry & Co. 1062
   - Deal v. Spears 1066

### G. COMPUTER MONITORING AND SEARCHES 1069

1. E-mail 1069
   - Smyth v. Pillsbury Co. 1070

2. Internet Use 1078
   - Leventhal v. Knapek 1078
   - United States v. Ziegler 1087

### 13 INTERNATIONAL PRIVACY LAW 1093

### A. THE OECD PRIVACY GUIDELINES 1096

1. The 1980 Original Guidelines 1096
2. The 2013 OECD Privacy Guidelines 1098

### B. PRIVACY PROTECTION IN EUROPE 1100

1. Divergence or Convergence? 1100
   - James Q. Whitman, *The Two Western Cultures of Privacy: Dignity Versus Liberty* 1100
   - Paul M. Schwartz & Karl-Nikolaus Peifer, *Transatlantic Data Privacy Law* 1104

2. European Convention on Human Rights Article 8 1107
   - ECHR Article 8 1109
   - Von Hannover v. Germany [No. 1] 1111
   - In the Case of Mosley v. The United Kingdom 1122
   - Satukunnan Markkinapörssi Oy and Satamedia Oy v. Finland 1133

3. European Union Data Protection 1140
   - The European Charter of Fundamental Rights, Articles 7 and 8 1140
     - EU Charter of Fundamental Human Rights, Articles 7 and 8 1140
   - The Data Protection Directive 1141
     - Criminal Proceedings Against Bodil Lindqvist 1146
     - Google Spain SL, Google Inc. v. Agencia Española de Protección de Datos (AEPD), Mario Costeja González 1151
     - Tele2 Sverige AB v. Post-och telestyrelsen & Sec’y of State for Home Dept v. Watson (Joined Cases) 1159
C. INTERNATIONAL TRANSFERS OF DATA 1173
1. International Data Transfers in Litigation 1174
   ● Volkswagen, A.G. v. Valdez 1174
2. Adequate Level of Protection 1177
3. From the Safe Harbor to the Privacy Shield 1179
   ● Shrems v. Data Protection Commissioner 1181
   ● EU-U.S. Privacy Shield Framework Principles Issued by the U.S. Department of Commerce 1187
   ● Paul M. Schwartz & Karl-Nikolaus Peifer, Transatlantic Data Privacy Law 1193
   ● Opinion 1/15 of the Court 1197

D. THE APEC PRIVACY FRAMEWORK 1203

E. PRIVACY PROTECTION IN NORTH AMERICA 1205
1. Canada 1205
2. Mexico 1207

F. PRIVACY PROTECTION IN SOUTH AMERICA 1208
1. Argentina 1208
2. Brazil 1208

G. PRIVACY PROTECTION IN AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST 1209
1. Africa 1209
2. The Middle East 1209

H. PRIVACY PROTECTION IN ASIA-PACIFIC 1210
1. Australia 1210
2. Japan 1211
3. China and Hong Kong 1211
4. South Korea 1213
5. India 1213

Index 1215